|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Beginning, 1** | **Developing, 2** | **Accomplished, 3** | **Exemplary, 4** | **Score** |
| **Catechin Chemistry**  **& Scheme 1** | Structures are shown but there are at least three errors. | All structures are shown but at least two errors. Flow, alignment, or coloring lacking. Legend in Word file. | All structures shown but one error. Color use appropriate. Logic & alignm. OK. Legend in Word file placed correctly. | Perfect reaction diagram, color enhances message. Caption in Word file at correct location with correct format. | /4 |
| **Simulated Spectra &**  **Fig. 1** | Attempts to compute spectra (i.e., , fi(), f() values) made. Problems with the concept of Gaussians, and the concept of superposition. | Fig. 1 shows all spectra. Shapes are recognizable. Colors and line styles mostly correct. X- and Y-ranges and graph format close to original. Legend present. | Fig. 1 shows all spectra with similar shapes and correct colors and line styles. Requested X- and Y-ranges, graph format close to original. Legend contains functions. | Fig. 1 shows all spectra with perfect shape, color and line style. Requested X- and Y-ranges; graph format perfect. Legend contains functions for pH = 12 curve. | /4 |
| **Simulated Thermograms**  **& Fig. 2**  **Counts x0.5** | Attempts to compute thermograms made, but graph does not simulate the original sufficiently well. | Fig. 2 shows both thermo-grams with recognizable shapes. Graph format close to original. Legend present. | Fig. 2 shows both thermo-grams with similar shapes. Graph formatting close to original. Legend contains both complete functions. | Thermograms with perfect shape, style, & graph formatting. Baselines shown dotted. Legend contains both complete functions. | /2 |
| **Organization of XL File** | Poorly organized XL file. Peer review would be premature. | Not really sure about the organization and/or the correctness of the data. | Comps. probably correct. Data are organized, but organization is not intuitive. | Comps. are correct. Well organized & easily accessible data on labeled sheets. | /4 |
| **Content of Text & Footnotes** | Major problems with the logic and with nomenclature. Fails to convey the big picture. | Text contains some lapses in logic and/or nomenclature. Art & most refs. cited in text. | Text makes sense, nomenclature mostly correct, most abbreviations defined. Art & refs. placed OK. | Purpose clear, text makes perfect sense. Art and refs. cited in text, at the correct place, in the correct format. | /4 |
| **Word File**  **Organization, & Formatting Counts x0.5** | File organization lacking. Formatting of document (body, legends, & footnotes) lacking. | Sequence, page breaks, header & footer, footnotes are mostly OK. Document formatting mostly OK. | Sequence, breaks, header & footer, footnotes A-OK. Doc. formatting (margins, font, font size, spacing) mostly OK. | Sequence, breaks, header & footer, footnotes, & document formatting (margins, font, size, line spacing) are A-OK. | /2 |
|  |  |  |  | **Total (Max. 20)** | /20 |
| Constructive Comments to Guide the Authors’ Revision: | | | | | |

Updated, 2016-03-03.